

Network Analysis Trough Scape and Flow Tourism Promotion in Bintan Regency

Jaya Hermawan¹, Evi Novianti², Awaludin Nugraha³, Uud Wahyudin⁴, Dina Oktavia⁵

^{1,2,3,4,5}Magister Pariwisata Berkelanjutan, Sekolah Pascasarjana Universitas Padjadjaran

Jaya21001@mail.unpad.ac.id, evi.novianti@unpad.ac.id, awaludin.nugraha@unpad.ac.id,

uudwahyudin@yahoo.co.id, dina.oktavia@unpad.ac.id

Abstract

This study describes the concept of network through the dimensions of scape and flow. To build an analytical framework that describes the two dimensions of the network, a literature study from various sources is carried out that discusses the context of tourism promotion. This analytical framework is then elaborated through the results of in-depth interviews with twenty informants who represent the main tourism stakeholders in Bintan Regency. The informants, among others, represent elements of the government, the private sector, academia, and the community. To strengthen the analysis, especially related to the development of tourism promotion which can be directly or indirectly seen from the trend of key tourism indicators in Bintan Regency, a literature review from various books, journals, research references and online news sources from the internet is used. The Result Main finding, established networks seldom play significant role in tourism promotion as they are viewed as already settled. While tourism promotion strategy tends to inherently shows innovation, so it won't be viewed as repetitive or redundant. This then affect engagement in post-Pandemic tourism, as shown with Bintan Regency case.

Keywords

network analysis; network tourism; tourism promotion; Bintan Regency



I. Introduction

The development of tourism is one of the ways to achieve public welfare, so it needs to be well planned and step by step to reach the right goal. The plan is compulsory in tourism development. Without the right goal, the development can lose focus and susceptible to the possibilities of unwanted negative impact. Since tourism is multisectoral then the planning requires commitment and continuous support from all the parties. Bintan Regency Government needs to coordinate and collaborate with the related stakeholders in the process of tourism development. Social network analysis is a diagnostic method to analyze data about patterns of collaboration, that is, relationships within the social structure that connect people in different groups (Seok et al., 2021). Network analyses in the tourism sector primarily focus on tourism research collaboration and knowledge creation, tourism destinations, supply chains, policies, tourist behaviors, and tourists' movement patterns (Jeon & Yang, 2021). Development is a systematic and continuous effort made to realize something that is aspired. Development is a change towards improvement. Changes towards improvement require the mobilization of all human resources and reason to realize what is aspired. In addition, development is also very dependent on the availability of natural resource wealth. The availability of natural resources is one of the keys to economic growth in an area. (Shah, M. et al. 2020).

The application of network concepts into tourism, and the use of network analysis, has gained attention in tourism (Raisi et al., 2020). Tourism destination management includes synergic activities of planning and organization, the strength of such a network can be enhanced to the advantage of any single stakeholder (Valeri & Baggio, 2021). The organized tourism events that are participated by the government, private sector, and the community shows an established network (Fauzi et al., 2022). Social practices are subject to relentless change, driven among other things by the power of networks to program and disseminate discourses that frame human action. In the context of tourism, the importance of linking the global space of flows, controlled by financial and media networks, with the local space of places where everyday activities take place. Thus, understanding contemporary tourism activity implies not just a consideration of the fragmentation of individualized consumption, but also the rapidly changing contexts that frame and reframe our choices (Bargeman & Richards, 2020). Entrepreneurs in the tourism sector may benefit from the creation of networks with the stakeholders to develop their business ideas. The cooperation between stakeholders in tourism companies is a prerequisite for the sustainable development of tourism (Lopes et al., 2021).

Promotion has a positive and significant effect on the satisfaction of visitors (Wahyudi & Yusra, 2021). Through social media platforms, it's possible nowadays to promote and attract the attention of tourists to come to visit a destination (Salem & Shuayb, 2022). In a good marketing process, promotion management is needed to achieve the target (Hermawan et al., 2022). Networks are made to ease the collaboration process between each party, including local and central government. The network between Bintan Regency and Singapore Government is going well despite the process still being insignificant. The system of regional management of innovation should be formed taking into account the principles of innovation in the field of tourism (Nodirabegim & Farangiz, 2021).

The promotion of Bintan Regency's tourism is improving, pushed by the needs of innovation to be consistent on increasing the tourist visits. The government is making numerous policy and program with the increasing of tourist visits as its goal. Several ways are also done by the government to promote Bintan tourism to foreigners. The concept of Halal Tourism is also tried to attract the Muslim Tourists to enjoy their visits in Bintan Regency. Bintan Resorts launch several initiatives from the collaboration of two institutions. Halaltrip, a portal specialized on providing halal tourism and Crescentrating, an institution which authorized to evaluate and accredit halal tourism. Up to this point, numerous place and facility has been rated based on its friendliness to Muslim tourists by Crescentrating. A guide which dedicated to Muslim tourists has been published to help them make decisions on choosing the resorts, attractions, and restaurants.

One place needs to bring out the element of novelty to create an innovation to promote its tourism. The government needs to collaborate with another sector with great human resources to handle the improvement of its promotion. The promotion strategy needs to be done to guarantee the continuity of tourism business. Using the existing network, the government successfully to pass the crisis due to Covid-19 pandemic. Tourism businesses and organizations rely on recovery forecasting when preparing their crisis recovery plans (H. Zhang et al., 2021). The existence of collaboration between Indonesian and Singaporean Government is resulting a steady network in tourism sector between Bintan Regency and Singapore. The location of Singapore which directly adjacent on the sea with Bintan Regency makes a direct access to a port in Lagoi tourism area. The Indonesian embassy also plays major role to coordinate between both countries to promote the tourism and strengthen the network.

The tourism network is still being expanded. In a past few years, China has started to dominate the Bintan Tourism. Chinese tourists are very dominating after the government and stakeholders expand its tourism network. China turns Bintan Regency to a destination because of there are many interesting and excellent places to choose. Intense promotion of Chinese journalists and numerous collaborations to their travel agency then giving them a great offer and promotion bring a positive impact to the development of Bintan tourism. The promotion process of Bintan tourism provides an overview of the sustainability of tourism business which is promising. As the development of networking still going, author wants to see and describe the extent to which existing tourism promotion is developed through the dimensions of scape and flow.

II. Review of Literature

Urry introduces a number of concepts "scapes" and "flows." Scapes are the "networks of machines, technologies, organizations, texts and actors that constitute various interconnected nodes along which the flows can be relayed". In other words, they maintain some semblance of structure. Flows, on the other hand, "consist of peoples, images, information, money and waste, that move within and especially across national borders and which individual societies are often unable or unwilling to control directly or indirectly". Flows within networks obviously generate both new opportunities as well as risks, and make it "less easy for states to mobilize clearly separate and coherent nations in pursuit of goals based upon society as region"(Urry, 2012).

The role of scapes in tourism promotion

- Media Information
Internet and digital technologies have become fundamentally integrated into our lives. The ubiquity of internet-enabled devices and associated mobile mediality have deeply influenced the tourism industry on an infrastructural and communicative level, book trips online, we talk to our friend back home, we can imagine faraway locations in images, texts, or virtual realities (Van Nuenen & Scarles, 2021). Social media platforms such as Flickr, Twitter, and Instagram allow users to share geolocated photos about a person's location at a particular time (Arkema et al., 2021).
- Infrastructure
Tourism infrastructure, usually includes the traffic, accommodation and attractions Zeng et al., (2021), Transport infrastructure exerts an important role in the movement of goods and people and positively impacts regional economic and income growth (J. Zhang & Zhang, 2022).
This underlines the need to constantly examine this sector from different perspectives in order to identify significant factors with the potential for tourism development. One of these factors may be transport infrastructure, specifically road transport infrastructure (Ivankova et al., 2021)
- Formal Institution
Regional formal institution has great influence on regional tourism development. A good regional formal institution plays a helping role in the development of regional tourism, which can further standardize the market performance of regional tourism, make the maintenance and upgrading of scenic spots, the service improvement of hotels and other aspects into a virtuous cycle, and can affect the development power of regional tourism at a deeper level (Wu et al., 2022). The policies of formal institutional agents are created and implemented through a process of interaction between different

private sector and state interests, objectives and strategies. However, it is relevant to clarify that institutions and states are different entities (Bertolini et al., 2022).

- Policy Document

Based on element of the tourism sector the policy document created knowledge on. Where a holistic approach was taken and interconnections between elements was recognized, this was coded as taking a systems approach (Loehr & Becken, 2021). The policy document which served to guide and provide strategic direction for the development and promotion of heritage and cultural tourism (Rogerson & Jayne, M, 2021).

- Actor

The regional actor network perspective points out that there are several stakeholders (such as organizations and persons within the organizations) who hold different kinds of relations, for example, who cooperate and coordinate their activities (Rohrer et al., 2021). For the ecosystem to thrive the focal actor needs to attract and create positive network effects otherwise, it faces the loss of investment (Jansson et al., 2022)

The importance of flow in tourism promotion

- Tourist Movement

In the context of tourism whereby tourist movement created to be to visit an attraction. This is showing the human needs to move from place of origin to destination with plenty of purposes (Azman et al., 2021). These so-called process-oriented tourists value touring, sightseeing, making multiple stops. They are less time constrained, likely to be on a multiple destination trip, often do not identify any single main destination and describe their journey as a vacation (McKercher et al., 2021).

- Destination Image

Importance of a positive destination image to attract tourists to visit, the image of a destination is the key to attracting tourists (Pereira et al., 2021). Destination image plays a salient role in marketing, brand differentiation, and tourist destination choice (Chiu et al., 2016; Mata et al., 2018; Song & Jeon, 2018). A good destination image is a destination that has unique elements (Liang, 2022; Marques et al., 2021; Santana & Gosling, 2018)

- Branding

Branding is one of those activities relating to destination marketing which is at promoting a tourist destination (Khandelwal & Kanda, 2021). Branding aims to build a positive image and reputation of the destination so that it is always good in the eyes of tourists, the imaging done can build trust (Haq et al., 2021). Benefits of branding in tourism development can provide clear revenue growth and a favorable destination image creating value for the region (Asadzadeh et al., 2021).

- Economy Impact

Economic impact becomes a very useful benchmark for estimating the socioeconomic effects generated by tourist activity (Martin Martin et al., 2019), Tourism activities have an impact on the economy and provide service benefits for tourism actors (Tohmo, 2018).

- Environment

The global goal of green growth and sustainable development, with the care for the environment being its essential element, is timeless. Therefore, the analysis of the development of the tourism sector should encompass its impact on the environment as well (Nagaj & Zuromskaite, 2021) Today, given the increasing concern with the effects of global environmental changes and related societal and cultural consequences, the tourism industry can potentially contribute to rebalancing the human-environment

relationship through creating and consuming geographically bound experiences (Usenyuk-Kravchuk et al., 2021). Given the growth rate of tourism and the positive impact of other sectors of the economy on the growth of welfare, as well as the need to take measures to protect the environment, the tourism industry is a sustainable development of the country (Umida et al., 2021).

III. Research Method

This study describes the concept of network through the dimensions of scape and flow. To build an analytical framework that describes the two dimensions of the network, a literature study from various sources is carried out that discusses the context of tourism promotion. This analytical framework is then elaborated through the results of in-depth interviews with twenty informants who represent the main tourism stakeholders in Bintan Regency. The informants, among others, represent elements of the government, the private sector, academia, and the community. To strengthen the analysis, especially related to the development of tourism promotion which can be directly or indirectly seen from the trend of key tourism indicators in Bintan Regency, a literature review from various books, journals, research references and online news sources from the internet is used.

IV. Result and Discussion

Bintan Regency is located in the Riau Islands Province which has direct sea borders with neighboring countries, namely Singapore and Malaysia. Neighboring countries are the main target in attracting tourists in the tourism sector in Bintan Regency. Singapore has long established a cooperative relationship in the field of tourism with the Bintan Regency government. In promoting tourism in order to achieve the target of domestic and foreign tourist visits, of course, various efforts are made to build a positive image of tourism destinations. Intensive tourism promotion and utilizing available networks are the best options. Promotional activities in order to raise, build, introduce and strengthen the image are called Branding.

In the framework of cooperation in the tourism sector, it is very important to communicate with travel agents abroad, in order to offer tour packages and provide information. Not only that, the series of event activities organized by the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency also involve third parties both from existing networks abroad, as well as Event Organizers as professional service providers in organizing various formal and non-formal events. Coordination and cooperation of tourism stakeholders are needed to support the development of tourism potential in an effort to provide optimal benefits from the tourism development activities. Strengthening and expanding the existence of tourism promotion in Bintan Regency abroad is very necessary.

Based on the interview results with the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency, the government must make efforts to facilitate, provide support, coordination, and synchronization of tourism promotion in Bintan Regency. The existence of representatives abroad to strengthen the function and existence of tourism promotion in Bintan Regency is through VITO (Visitor Indonesian Tourism Officer). In building relationships across overseas networks, various activities are carried out by the Bintan Regency Office. By organizing events and participating in events or exhibitions abroad in order to promote tourism in Bintan Regency. Introducing tourist destinations and tourism information networks in various strategic locations, such as ferry ports and airports. Development of direct sales facilities (through e-commerce) for tourists to be able to buy tour packages

directly. Establishing tourism promotion cooperation with print media and overseas travel agents through VITO.

Original Local Government Revenue of Bintan Regency is dominated by the tourism sector which is the main revenue for Bintan Regency. Contributions to the tourism sector in Bintan Regency alone reached 67.7%. This amount is obtained through various aspects, such as the collection of hotel tax, entertainment tax, street lighting tax, restaurant tax, and parking tax in the Lagoi international tourism area. The following table shows the number of foreign tourist visits to Bintan Regency.

Table 1. Foreign Tourist Visit Count of Riau Islands Province

Entry Point	2016	2017	2018	2019
Batam	1.432.472	1.564.717	1.887.244	1.947.943
Bintan	305.404	371.592	523.106	634.735
Tanjungpinang	93.249	117.882	140.596	169.364
Karimun	89.107	85.771	84.718	112.753
Total	1.920.232	2.139.962	2.635.664	2.864.795

Source: BPS Kepulauan Riau

Promotional efforts made by the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency before the COVID-19 pandemic were to organize sustainable tourism events such as Tour de Bintan, Ironman, Bintan Triathlon, Spartan Bintan Tourism, and Sail Bintan. Other promotional improvements are organizing exhibitions, providing Bintan promotional materials in which there are Bintan tourism destinations, compiling tourism highlight books, developing Bintan promotional galleries, compiling tourism statistics books, and a tourism website that constantly displays updated information. In order to maintain a positive image of the promotion that has been carried out, the development of tourist destinations is also needed. For example, by maintaining tourism objects/areas, structuring tourism areas, tourism amenity, and landscape and arrangement of tourism destinations.

The existence of Bintan Regency tourism as an international standard tourist area has become worse since the entry of COVID-19 pandemic in early 2019. Of course this is a disaster for the tourism industry in Bintan Regency, whose income is dominated by the tourism sector. Starting from January 2019 until now, there has been a significant reduction in the number of foreign tourists to the Riau Islands, including Bintan Regency, due to Indonesia closing access to entrances and exits of foreign tourists. The stipulation of the Regulation of the Minister of Law and Human Rights of the Republic of Indonesia Number 11 of 2020 which discusses the temporary prohibition of foreigners entering the territory of the Republic of Indonesia as a step to close the entrance for foreigners is a preventive measure taken by the Government of Indonesia in maintaining and reducing positive cases of COVID-19 in Indonesia has actually backfired on the tourism sector in Bintan Regency. The impact of the pandemic on the Lagoi International Tourism Area itself has resulted in many hotels and other businesses temporarily closing.

The Bintan Regency Government took the policy to conduct paradiplomacy with Singapore as a step in achieving the reactivation of Lagoi International Tourism Area.

Meetings regarding this tourist travel corridor have been repeatedly conducted by Bintan Resorts and also the Bintan Regency Government with the Ministry of Singapore. The COVID-19 pandemic that limits face-to-face meetings presents a solution, namely online meetings. The online paradiplomacy practice carried out by the Bintan Regency Government is through the zoom meeting media. Together with PT. Bintan Resort Cakrawala, the Bintan Regency Government held various webinars through the zoom meeting media.

In addition to maintaining communication and various negotiations, the Bintan Regency Government through the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency is also actively promoting tourism with PT. Bintan Resort Cakrawala (BRC). Tourism promotion is conducted online through following trends during the pandemic and targeting the international market. This was done as a step to redevelop Lagoi tourism after the opening of cross-border tourist travel corridors. Some of the promotional movements carried out by the Bintan Regency Government together with PT. BRC include The Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy Webinar For Japan Market: "Welcoming The New Normal: Bali & Bintan", Webinar "SIJORI Tourism Talk": Singapore, Johor, Indonesia -Batam & Bintan, Webinar "GMP": Riau Islands Tourism Strategy Towards Global Market, and VITO Malaysia Webinar with Lintas Travel & Bintan Resorts: "Riau Island Tourism Update".

Developments for the tourism recovery process, the Indonesian government is collaborating with Singapore to open a Riau Islands travel bubble to address the pandemic period. Travel bubble requires a network of cooperation by the Regional Government of Bintan Regency with PT. BRC as the relevant stakeholder in the Lagoi tourism area. In addition to conducting various tourism promotions, the Bintan Regency Government has also taken other policies that can support the reactivation of Lagoi as an international standard tourism area. The Regional Government of Bintan Regency collaborates with PT. BRC in preparing standards for the submission of Lagoi in the travel bubble. Bintan Regency Government together with PT. BRC cooperated with each other in the preparation of standards for the submission of Lagoi as a pilot project for cross-country tourist travel corridors.

One example of a standard that must be prepared is hotel management that meets the requirements of the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy program, namely Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment Sustainability (CHSE). The Bintan Regency Government encourages hotels in Lagoi to obtain CHSE certification. The efforts and policies made by the Bintan Regency Government have yielded positive results with Bintan Resorts obtaining a CHSE certification plaque from the Ministry of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia. Bintan Resorts is the first location in Indonesia to receive the CHSE certification plaque.

The existing tourism network continues to be strengthened, the existence of associations and organizations engaged in tourism, such as the Association of the Indonesian Tour and Travel Agencies (ASITA) which acts as the main actor of national tourism that participates in promoting destinations through tour packages and bringing in domestic and foreign tourists. Based on interview results, so far ASITA has always been involved by the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency in promotional activities, both activities carried out domestically and abroad. For activities carried out in Indonesia, all are under the responsibility of the Tourism Office. Then ASITA helps promote and create tour packages and sell the potential and attractiveness of the Tourism Office. For activities carried out abroad, they are usually facilitated by the Ministry of Tourism and the Tourism Office of Riau Islands Province. The contribution made is to help promote various packages and potential tourism attractions through exhibition stands provided by the

organizing country. Then from the results that are promoted, communication is usually built from the agent. The process of negotiating tourism offers involves agent to agent from the tourist or group. Because in foreign countries they cannot go directly to consumers, they must go through an agent to agent intermediary, so foreign parties have cooperation with agents. Then the agent communicates to provide offers to negotiate all the needs and take care of the process of sending their guests.

Then the Indonesian Hotel and Restaurant Association (PHRI) is an organization that is oriented towards the development and improvement of tourism, in order to participate in carrying out national development and is a unifying forum in fighting for and creating a business climate that concerns the dignity of entrepreneurs engaged in tourism accommodation/hotel services and food and beverage/restaurant services as well as tourism education institutions. In the same activity, PHRI is also always involved in the activities of the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency.

In conducting good communication and relationships with all actors, the Tourism Office of Bintan Regency communicates with stakeholders and several important actors both at the domestic and international levels. The Provincial Government together with the Central and Regency/City Governments are tasked with developing the community and various kinds of public services needed so that tourism can be organized in that place and the tourism industry can develop. In addition, the government plays a direct role in the development of regulations to govern, control the activities of developers and industries, and strengthen institutions to increase capacity in formulating policies and decision-making at various levels of government.

Businesses (private sector) acts as a tourism business organizer according to business ethics, professional, responsible and sustainable. The role of the business world as a profit-oriented institution must also take responsibility for environmental sustainability as the main capital of tourism. Private partnerships with the community and government are needed in the true sense. A win-win relationship must be built with formal and non-formal approaches. Some successful tourism destinations involve many parties, one of which is due to building a non-formal approach between the private sector and the government.

Community includes the community and communities (NGOs) the community plays a role in supporting *sapta pesona*- seven elements contained in each tourism product and used as a benchmark for improving the quality of tourism products-and providing tourism or creative economy services. The community is the object and subject of tourism itself, but on the other hand the community can be an obstacle to tourism development in a destination. Therefore, the community must know exactly what their role is and that tourism is for their welfare as well. Continuous assistance from the government, NGOs and the private sector can increase the role of the community in regional tourism development.

Academicians play a role in conducting various research and community service related to tourism development, so that research-based tourism development continues to grow. Often the role of research results is not utilized in tourism development. Various community services can be carried out by academics in tourism development, for this reason communication and cooperation with academics are needed in tourism development.

Bintan Regency's tourism promotion network is still growing to gain public attention. The development of existing networks continues to help tourism progress. Countries that have become the network of Bintan Regency need to continue to be considered for the sustainability of tourism. Tourism is starting to revive after the long wait for the COVID-19 pandemic. The recovery of the tourism sector is a special concern that must be addressed by the local government. All sectors feel the unfavorable impact of the COVID-

19 pandemic. Bintan Regency, which relies heavily on the tourism sector, of course, must recover as soon as possible because cross-country crossings are allowed. Foreign tourists have started coming to visit Bintan. Foreign tourists, dominated by Singaporeans, began to arrive in Bintan because of the close distance and the Singaporean people already knew Bintan as a very attractive destination for vacation activities. Bintan is famous for its luxury resorts and unique and diverse destinations.

Based on the results of interviews, most informants provided information that the government had carried out tourism promotion through information media. Providing information to the public is a shared task of both the government and the community. Utilizing the website is of course the main priority of the Bintan Regency Tourism Office by providing reliable human resources who can take advantage of technology that has developed rapidly. It is known that so far, the obstacle is the lack of human resources who properly control the management of the website.

Then, based on the results of interviews, most informants provided information that infrastructure in Bintan Regency was quite good in the tourism sector because tourism was the main concern of the government. Since tourism makes the biggest contribution to regional income. Hence, all aspects that support tourism keep on being addressed so that tourists feel the ease of traveling. From the interviews, it is known that formal institutions also have an important part in the implementation of tourism development. Cooperation between formal institutions is unavoidable because they are interrelated and must be involved to promote tourism in Bintan Regency. The number of tourism events certainly involves many other parties, and the government cannot work alone, so it must involve formal institutions that support tourism.

The results of an interview with one of the informants said that to achieve the sustainable tourism goals of Bintan Regency, the local government also made policy documents. For the direction of tourism development, the government makes a document of the Regional Tourism Development Master Plan as a guide for achieving indicators of successful performance achievements.

Based on the results of interviews, most informants said that the Tourism Office is the main actor in the task of leading, fostering and coordinating as well as controlling and evaluating activities for formulating operational technical policy planning programs for development and improvement of implementation in an effort to provide public and technical services in the tourism sector, creative economy includes business secretariat, marketing affairs, business services and tourism guidance, tourism destination development and creative economy in line with regional general policies and in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations.

The movement of tourists arises because of the urge to carry out tourism activities. A person's decision to travel is influenced by the strong driving factor, namely the desire to break away from daily routines and habits. It is also influenced by the availability of unique and interesting tourist attractions to visit. The increase in tourist movement is also influenced by technological advances that can provide information through social media that provides information related to interesting destinations. Based on the results of an interview with one of the informants said that a lot of tourists who come from other countries get information from news and social media.

Based on the results of interviews from most informants, the image of the Bintan Regency destination is quite good because the existing destinations provide a sense of security and comfort for tourists. The best service is certainly given to build a good image for tourists. A good destination image will give full confidence to other people who will visit Bintan. Regarding branding itself, one informant said that there must be innovation

towards branding progress because it still maintains the old branding. Branding must be built on the uniqueness or specificity of an area and communicate it to tourists or investors by using names, taglines, symbols, designs or a combination of these media to create a positive image. From the results of the interview, it is known that the presence of many tourist visits can certainly have a positive economic impact on the region and the local community. MSMEs really feel the tremendous impact if the tourism industry continues to progress rapidly.

From the interviews, it is known that the environment is also affected by tourism activities, especially in this case the waste generated from tourism activities. The government also appealed to the public and tourists to care about the environment and nature conservation. Tourists who visit Bintan Regency can also get interesting and unique experiences in nature conservation, namely being able to participate in mangrove reforestation activities, coral transplantation and releasing turtle hatchlings and other interesting activities. In the past few years, the trend of market segmentation of foreign tourists in Bintan has begun to shift, initially dominated by the old network and then being rivalled by the new network, namely China. In the past, the opening of direct international flights to Bintan Island made many Chinese tourists come. However, based on the results of interviews obtained information that the large number of tourists is not directly proportional to the expenditure of money spent.

V. Conclusion

Main finding, established networks seldom play significant role in tourism promotion as they are viewed as already settled. While tourism promotion strategy tends to inherently shows innovation, so it won't be viewed as repetitive or redundant. This then affect engagement in post-Pandemic tourism, as shown with Bintan Regency case. Promotion of tourism in Bintan Regency there is an involvement between the roles of stakeholders, the private sector, and of course the local community. For that all must collaborate to strengthen the network and innovate in tourism promotion.

References

- Arkema, K. K., Fisher, D. M., Wyatt, K., Wood, S. A., & Payne, H. J. (2021). Advancing sustainable development and protected area management with social media-based tourism data. *Sustainability*, 13(5), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13052427>
- Asadzadeh, M., Vatankhah, S., & Aryankhesal, A. (2021). The main city branding dimensions in health tourism development: A scoping review. *Journal of Contemporary Issues in Business and Government*, 27(2), 6446–6460. <https://doi.org/10.47750/cibg.2021.27.02.631>
- Azman, N. A. N. M. N., Abd Rahman, N. H., Md Sawari, S. S., Abas, S. A., & Latif, S. A. (2021). The tourists' spatial behaviour and tourist movement pattern in Muar Johor. *Planning Malaysia*, 19(2), 275–286. <https://doi.org/10.21837/PM.V19I16.970>
- Bargeman, B., & Richards, G. (2020). A new approach to understanding tourism practices. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 84. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2020.102988>
- Bertolini, O. T., Monticelli, J. M., Garrido, I. L., Verschoore, J. R., & Henz, M. (2022). Achieving legitimacy of a film-tourism strategy through joint private–public policymaking. *International Journal of Tourism Cities*, 8(2), 424–443. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJTC-04-2021-0066>
- Chiu, W., Zeng, S., & Cheng, P. S. T. (2016). The influence of destination image and

- tourist satisfaction on tourist loyalty: a case study of Chinese tourists in Korea. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism, and Hospitality Research*, 10(2), 223–234. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJCTHR-07-2015-0080>
- Fauzi, A., Satyawati, I. A., & Nurhaeni, I. D. A. (2022). Jogjavaganza event as one of the communication media to promote Yogyakarta City tourism. *Pemerintah, Swasta, Dan Masyarakat Menunjukkan Jaringan Yang Mapan*, 9(1), 498–506. <https://ijmmu.com/index.php/ijmmu/article/view/3412>
- Haq, F., Seraphim, J., & Medhekar, A. (2021). Branding heritage tourism in Dubai: A qualitative study. *Advances in Hospitality and Tourism Research*, 9(2), 243–267. <https://doi.org/10.30519/ahtr.782679>
- Hermawan, H., Santosa, S., Wijayanti, A., Novia, C. N., Dwi, A. S., & Jonet, N. S. (2022). The significance of tourism attraction and social media promotion on the interest of return visit. *Tourism and Hospitality International Journal*, 18(1), 60–83.
- Ivankova, V., Gavurova, B., Bacik, R., & Rigelsky, M. (2021). Relationships between road transport infrastructure and tourism spending: A development approach in European OECD countries. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 9(2), 535–551. [https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2021.9.2\(35\)](https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2021.9.2(35))
- Jansson, J., Johansson, O., & Roshan, M. (2022). Initiating a smart tourism ecosystem: A public actor perspective. *Proceedings of the 55th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, 2700–2709. <https://doi.org/10.24251/hicss.2022.335>
- Jeon, C. Y., & Yang, H. W. (2021). The structural changes of a local tourism network: Comparison of before and after COVID-19. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 24(23), 3324–3338. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2021.1874890>
- Khandelwal, A., & Kanda, P. (2021). A Study on the impact of destination branding on tourism. *Journal of Contemporary Research in Management*, 10(1), 79–87.
- Liang, M. (2022). Shaping the image of tourism destination by network tourism news. 623, 623–632.
- Loehr, J., & Becken, S. (2021). The tourism climate change knowledge system. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 86, 103073. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2020.103073>
- Lopes, J. M., Oliveira, M., Lopes, J., & Zaman, U. (2021). Networks, innovation and knowledge transfer in tourism industry: An empirical study of smes in Portugal. *Social Sciences*, 10(5), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci10050159>
- Marques, C., Vinhas da Silva, R., & Antova, S. (2021). Image, satisfaction, destination and product post-visit behaviours: How do they relate in emerging destinations? *Tourism Management*, 85. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2021.104293>
- Martin Martin, J. M., Guaita Martinez, J. M., & Burgos Mascarell, A. (2019). Promotion and economic impact of foreign tourism. *Journal of Promotion Management*, 25(5), 722–737. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10496491.2019.1585602>
- Mata, I. L., Fossgard, K., & Haukeland, J. V. (2018). Do visitors gaze and reproduce what destination managers wish to commercialise? Perceived and projected image in the UNESCO World Heritage area “West Norwegian Fjords.” *International Journal of Digital Culture and Electronic Tourism*, 2(4), 294. <https://doi.org/10.1504/ijdcet.2018.092205>
- McKercher, B., Filep, S., & Moyle, B. (2021). Movement in tourism: Time to re-integrate the tourist? *Annals of Tourism Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2021.103199>
- Nagaj, R., & Zuromskaite, B. (2021). Tourism in the era of covid-19 and its impact on the environment. *Energies*, 14(7), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.3390/en14072000>
- Nodirabegim, A. F., & Farangiz, A. F. (2021). Innovative activity in the field of tourism.

Innovative Thoughts, Research Ideas and Inventions in Sciences.

- Pereira, M. de L., Anjos, F. A. dos, Anana, E. da S., & Weismayer, C. (2021). Modelling the overall image of coastal tourism destinations through personal values of tourists: A robust regression approach. *Journal of Outdoor Recreation and Tourism*, 35(2021). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jort.2021.100412>
- Raisi, H., Baggio, R., Barratt-Pugh, L., & Willson, G. (2020). A network perspective of knowledge transfer in tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 80. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2019.102817>
- Rogerson, C. M., & Jayne, M. R. (2021). 'In-between' rural tourism: Rethinking rural tourism spaces for policy development in South Africa. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 10(4), 1394–1413. <https://doi.org/10.46222/ajhtl.19770720-169>
- Rohrer, N., Vogelsang, B., & Fuchs, M. (2021). The region matters-for whom? The regional actor network for vocational education and training in tourism of Cancun (Mexico). *International Journal of Training and Development*, 25(3), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijtd.12217>
- Salem, O. S., & Shuayb, A. (2022). Contribution of social media platforms in tourism promotion. *Sinomys Journal*, 1(2), 189–198.
- Santana, L. D., & Gosling, M. D. S. (2018). Dimensions of image: A model of destination image formation. *Tourism Analysis*, 23(3), 303–322. <https://doi.org/10.3727/108354218X15305418666940>
- Seok, H., Barnett, G. A., & Nam, Y. (2021). A social network analysis of international tourism flow. *Quality and Quantity*, 55(2), 419–439. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-020-01011-8>
- Shah, M. et al. (2020). The Development Impact of PT. Medco E & P Malaka on Economic Aspects in East Aceh Regency. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*. P. 276-286.
- Song, C. M., & Jeon, H. Y. (2018). A semiotic study of regional branding reflected in the slogans of Korean regions. *Social Semiotics*, 28(2), 230–256. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10350330.2017.1292628>
- Tohmo, T. (2018). The economic impact of tourism in Central Finland: a regional input–output study. *Tourism Review*, 73(4), 521–547. <https://doi.org/10.1108/TR-04-2017-0080>
- Umida, S. Z. T., Shahzoda, G. B. T., Dilshod, A. A. T., & Dilnoza, S. A. (2021). Problems in tourism in Uzbekistan. *An International Multidisciplinary Research Journal*, 11(11), 256–258. <https://doi.org/10.5958/2249-7137.2021.02447.2>
- Urry, J. (2012). *Sociology beyond societies: Mobilities for the twenty-first century*. In Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203021613>
- Usenyuk-Kravchuk, S., Gostyaeva, M., Raeva, A., & Garin, N. (2021). Encountering the extreme environment through tourism: The arctic design approach. *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management*, 19(1). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2020.100416>
- Valeri, M., & Baggio, R. (2021). Italian tourism intermediaries: a social network analysis exploration. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 24(9), 1270–1283. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2020.1777950>
- Van Nuenen, T., & Scarles, C. (2021). Advancements in technology and digital media in tourism. *Tourist Studies*, 21(1), 119–132. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468797621990410>
- Wahyudi, R., & Yusra, I. (2021). Marketing management studies the effect of tourism promotion, prices and facilities on visitors' satisfaction of sweet water beach tourism

- Padang. *Marketing Management Studies*, 1(2), 151–162.
<https://doi.org/10.24036/jkmp.v1i1>
- Wu, Y., Wang, D., Bao, J., & Qu, J. (2022). The role of regional formal institution and foreign direct investment in the performance of tourism firms. *International Journal of Business Management and Finance Research*, 5(2), 46–66.
<https://doi.org/10.53935/26415313.v5i2.224>
- Zeng, J., Wen, Y., Bi, C., & Feiock, R. (2021). Effect of tourism development on urban air pollution in China: The moderating role of tourism infrastructure. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 280, 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.124397>
- Zhang, H., Song, H., Wen, L., & Liu, C. (2021). Forecasting tourism recovery amid COVID-19. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 87.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2021.103149>
- Zhang, J., & Zhang, Y. (2022). Tourism, transport infrastructure and income inequality: A panel data analysis of China. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 25(10), 1607–1626.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2021.1928012>